



Rov in Metal Keilim

In this week's *Mishnayot* we transitioned from discussing earthenware utensil to discussing metal *keilim*. One unique law that applies to metal *keilim* is as follows. If a *tameh kli* was broken, then the *kli* become *tahor*. For all other *keilim*, even if the *kli* was repaired, it would still be *tahor*. For metal *keilim* however, if the *kli* is repaired or another *kli* is fashioned out of the broken material, the *kli* becomes *tameh* again. We learnt that this was out of concern that people might misunderstand the laws of *tumah*. In truth, if the *kli* was repaired it would be immediately *tahor*. The concern was that people might see this and think that the same is true if a *tameh kli* was immersed in a *mikveh*. The truth however is that one would need to wait until nightfall for the *kli* to be completely *tahor*.

The *Mishnah* (11:4) however discusses the case where a *kli* was made from pieces of metal that were originally from both *tameh* and *tahor keilim*. The *Mishnah* teaches that if most of the material came from the *tameh* vessel then this new *kli* would be *tameh*. If however, a majority was from the *tahor kli* then it would be *tahor*. Half-half? The *Mishnah* rules that it would be *tameh*. We shall try to understand this *Mishnah*.

It would seem that the principle underlying this *Mishnah* is *bitul*. In other words, once the *tumah* is in the minority it is annulled. That is indeed how the *Mishnah Achrona* understands the *Mishnah*.

The first point he makes is that *bitul* only works if we are discussing a mixture of raw material. If however one has multiple different *keilim*, some that are *tahor* and some that were made from broken *tameh keilim*, then one cannot rely on *bitul* to treat the entire mixture as *tahor*. The reason is that since the matter can be resolved simply,¹ by immersing all the *keilim* in a *mikveh*, it would mean that this is a case of *davar she'yesh lo matirin*. In

other words, one has an alternative to resolving the issue, therefore *bitul* will not work.

That being the case, why is our case also not considered a *davar she'yesh lo matirin*, considering that the new *kli* can simply be immersed in a *mikveh*. The *Mishnah Achrona* stresses that if the *issur* is not yet "known" at the time of *bitul*, it is annulled even in a case that is ultimately a *davar she'yesh lo matirin*. In our case too, it is only once the new *kli* is completed that the *tumah* returns. That point is long after the metals have been mixed together.

The *Sidrei Tahorot* however finds this understanding of the *Mishnah* difficult. One reason is that if the law relied on *bitul* one would have expected R' Yehuda to argue with the ruling. That is because he maintains *min be'mino* (when the mixture is the same material it) is not *batel*. Even though that position is only in the case of liquids and not solids, he maintains that position with solids that mix well like liquids and our case would certainly qualify.

Consequently, he understands that *Mishnah* is not based on *bitul*. *Bitul* is needed when it is necessary for the mixed in forbidden component to become permitted so that the entire mixture can be consumed. That is why R' Yehuda argues that when it is *min be'mino* that outcome cannot be achieved. Our case however is different. Much like the *Mishnah Achrona* noted above, the issue is only once the *kli* has been made from *tameh* material. Prior to that point all the material is *tahor*. In our case, for the new *kli* to become *tameh*, the question is what was the material that gave it its form. This is not based on *bitul*. Rather if most of the form of the *kli* that was from *tameh* material, then the law that the *tumah* returns applies. If however, most of the form was from *tahor* material, then the *kli* is *tahor*.



¹ The operative term is the resolution is "simple". When it comes to issues of *kashrut*, even though the matter can also be resolved with *kashering*, since there is an expense involved it is not considered a *davar she'yesh lo matirin*.



REVISION QUESTIONS

טהרות י"ז - י"ב:ג'

- Explain the case of the old oven inside the new oven? (י"ז:ג')
- Why and how does the law change when the new oven is inside the old oven? (י"ז:ג')
- Explain the case of the three *lefasim*. (י"ח:ח')
- Are flat metal vessels susceptible to *tumah*? (י"א:א')
- What is the law regarding *tameh* metal utensils that were broken then fixed again? (י"א:א')
- Explain the debate regarding the previous question. (י"א:א')
- List the seven metal utensils that are not susceptible to *tumah* and explain. (י"א:ב')
- What is the law regarding utensils made from boards of metal and what is the concern? (י"א:ג')
- What substance is the subject of debate when used to form utensils? (י"א:ג')
- What is the law regarding a utensil formed from metal from a mixture of *tameh* and *tahor* utensils? (י"א:ד')
- What are two laws regarding a *klustera*? (י"א:ד')
- What are the two parts of the reins that are discussed? List the three opinions regarding their susceptibility to *tumah*. (י"א:ה')
- What is a *pika* and explain the debate regarding its susceptibility to *tumah*? (י"א:ה')
- When is a flute containing metal not susceptible to *tumah*? (י"א:ו')
- When is an animal horn susceptible to *tumah*? (Provide both cases.) (י"א:ו')
- Which battle armour is susceptible to *tumah*? (י"א:ז')
- Are weapons susceptible to *tumah*? (י"א:ז')
- Is jewellery susceptible to *tumah*? (י"א:ח')
- Describe the *nezem* that if broken two parts are still susceptible to *tumah*? (י"א:ט')
- Which rings are susceptible to *tumah*? (י"ב:א')
- Provide two cases when a chain is susceptible to *tumah*? (י"ב:א')
- When is a *kane moznaim* of *ba'alei batim tameh*? (י"ב:ב')
- What is the general rule provided regarding the susceptibility to *tumah* of *uklayot*? (List some of the cases.) (י"ב:ב')
- Explain the debate regarding a metal covering of a *teni*. (י"ב:ג')
- Regarding the previous question, what case is not the subject of debate? (י"ב:ג')
- What case is similar to the one in the previous question? (י"ב:ג')
- Is a picture frame hook susceptible to *tumah*? (י"ב:ג')



ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier

mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter

mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown

www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld

Rabbi C. Brown

<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>



APPS

Mishnah Yomit

mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah

Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi

Ohr Somayach, South Africa

Kehati



KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss

In US dial: 718 906 6400

Then select: 1 - 2 - 4

NEXT WEEK'S MISHNAYOT

SUNDAY	MONDAY	TUESDAY	WEDNESDAY	THURSDAY	FRIDAY	שבת קודש
21 June · ו' תמוז	22 June · ז' תמוז	23 June · ח' תמוז	24 June · ט' תמוז	25 June · י' תמוז	26 June · י"א תמוז	27 June · י"ב תמוז
Keilim 12:4-5	Keilim 12:6-7	Keilim 12:8-13:1	Keilim 13:2-3	Keilim 13:4-5	Keilim 13:6-7	Keilim 13:8-14:1

Have a good Shabbos!